Peter Barrand<br>newsXpress West Lakes

Shop 12/13 West Lakes Mall
111 Turner Drive

West Lakes
South Australia
Ph 0428833494

26 May 2015
Hannah Ransom
Australian Competition and Consumer Affairs

RE; Association of Magazine Publishers of Australia Inc. application for authorisation A91472 - Submission 2

## Dear Hannah

I would like to make a second submission regarding the proposed MPA Trial for the ACCC to consider. Attached are spreadsheets and photographs to help back up my concerns that the current rules of the proposed MPA Trial will not be very different to the current system except the removal of early returns of magazines, and therefore Newsagents will not benefit at all from the MPA Trial and there will therefore be no public benefit, no gained profitability for Newsagents and no gained competitiveness for Newsagents. In fact Newsagents will be worse off if these current set of rules are used to form an Industry Code of Conduct.

I am not opposed to a trial, but the rules and motives must be carefully considered before a trial gets underway. A trial for example under current rules may well prove what the MPA says it will. They control supply and can set parameters to make the trial work, and I cannot see how the current rules will not work in a trial. What I am opposed to and extremely concerned about is if the current rules are then approved for the Industry Code of Conduct.

I have collated this year's sales and returns data in a spreadsheet and have taken photographs to highlight some current issues such as how long some of the on sale dates are on magazines, how bagging magazines affects newsagents, and how the practice of Delayed billing can be used to push out return dates of magazines. The figures will quantify why there can be a large increase in the amount of magazines distributed under the Trial rules and will show why the need to retain early returns of magazines is a must for Newsagents to remain in the business of magazines and to have any chance of being competitive in the uneven playing field we now have. Any Trial proposal that removes early returns must be clearly stated that it is for the Trial purposes only so that the MPA cannot then claim it as part of an industry Code of Conduct.

Attachment "mag sales" shows the year to date sales of magazines Gordon and Gotch V's Network Services(Bauer), with $58 \%$ of $\$$ sales being Gotch, and $42 \%$ of $\$$ sales being Network.

Attachment "mag returns" shows the weekly magazine returns for the year to date of Gordon and Gotch V's Network Services(Bauer). On time returns are the returns directed by the MPA to come off the shelf on that current week and most may be returned as covers only. Supplementary returns are $99.9 \%$ early returns, and a small amount of Supplementary returns are magazines returned that were missed on the shelf when taking off On time returns or magazines we chose to leave on the shelf past the return date to gain more sales.

The figures clearly demonstrate that with $55.4 \%$ of supplementary magazine returns, yet only $42 \%$ of sales Network Services(Bauer) are abusing their supply power against us and to use the MPA phrase are indiscriminately supplying us with magazines that do not sell, yet they get paid to distribute them. This is deliberate as they have Xchange it data to correct supply. Our returns are at $27 \%$ of all magazines received, and we have worked extremely hard over 4 years to get this figure down from over $50 \%$. The MPA trial rules takes away our ability to early return these magazines, does not limit the amount of magazine titles to available pockets, and does not address limiting the amount of magazines supplied because the rules state they can supply to a $45 \%$ to $55 \%$ sell through, which is a massive increase on what we have now. We do not have the space for a $23 \%$ increase in magazines, most of which we do not have the consumer market for and are magazines that we have already reduced over 4 years. Of the many magazine titles that we do not get oversupplied with now for whatever reason, they can be increased considerably under the trial rules giving us a further increase in oversupplied titles. This will leave us less profitable, and less competitive. The current Trial rules, if implemented into an industry "Code of Conduct" will put many newsagents in a position of financial and personal stress.

Attachment "mag volume" shows the amount of returns on 14.5.15 with the pile on the right being Network (Bauer), and significantly more than Gotch. This ratio of Network to Gotch is normal. These are all early returns except for one box for each supplier, and has to be taken off the shelf to fit new arrivals.

Attachment "poor sale 1" shows Aust 4WD Action, received 8 bagged mags. They were on sale for 54 days with zero sales and still had 4 weeks to go till return date set by MPA when we early returned them. The MPA Trial rules say we have to keep them for 4 more weeks.

Attachment "long onsale delay bill" shows Poolside Showcase. Arrived April 2nd, early returned 2 immediately as only 2 would fit in a pocket, sold 1 on May 23rd and still have 1 today (30.5.15). Delayed billing to August 20th with a return date of late October. With a sale value of $\$ 9.95$ and an onsale period of some 22 weeks, at a profit of $\$ 2.26$ per mag it is not worth keeping for more than 6 weeks at most. With a delayed billing for August 20th how do we track return credits for those returned early? By the MPA Trial rules we have to keep all 4 until October.

Attachment "Delay bill A" shows 4 Secondhand Boat Secrets arrived on December 22cnd 2014. Sold 1 on January 16th. We early returned 3 on May 9th after 74 days on the shelf. For a profit of $\$ 2.71$ after 74 days these magazines did not pay the rent for their space, even with a delayed bill until April 20th. By the MPA Trial rules we will have to keep these until July.

Attachment "bagged mags" shows another issue we have with distributors and the MPA which is not covered adequately in the MPA Trial rules. On May 21st we received 1)Wheels magazine June issue and 2)Wheels magazine June issue plus the current Motor issue bagged together. The current Motor issue has been on the shelf for 2 weeks unbagged. This continuous crossover of magazines and recycling of old magazines bagged together confuses customers and gets them angry, especially if their only choice to buy the current
magazine they want is bagged with another at an increased price. They nearly always just want the one magazine. To have them all on the shelf together in this case is ridiculous, space wasting and time wasting. We have even had 2 of the same magazines in the same bag! All the bagged magazines have their old return stickers left on them so quality control is poor or non-existent.

These examples are a very small sample of this type of oversupply we deal with every day, as can be seen by the volume of early returns on the spreadsheet and photo supplied.

If the ACCC is to make an informed decision I believe the ACCC must look at all aspects of the magazine industry as there are at least two clear models, one for newsagencies, the other being for the supermarkets and convenience/petrol outlets, giving them substantial benefits over the newsagency channel model. A post deregulation (1999) assessment/enquiry of the newsagency channel regarding magazines is long overdue.

Another point I would like to make about newsagents being disadvantaged is the returns of magazines are a cost for newsagents, yet I believe there are no returns for supermarkets. Also we are required to have a Bank Guarantee to have an account with Network Services to the value of $\$ 13,400$, tying up funds. This guarantee cost us $\$ 250$ to set up and has a $1.5 \%$ annual fee. It is hard to see supermarkets agreeing to this!

On this issue we have resigned from the ANF because the ANF is severely out of touch with the reality of what newsagents require. Even though they have membership of slightly over half of all newsagents, but falling fast, they are not representing newsagents views on this matter and many other issues. Their failure to communicate adequately and willingness to jump on the bandwagon with the MPA without consulting newsagencies views on this serious matter to me shows the ANF has a complete lack of knowledge of industry problems.

In closing, I believe the information provided here shows that the MPA Trial rules have the ability to extend the oversupply of magazines. There is really a lack of rules to get any meaningful information from the trial. If these current Trial rules are engaged as an industry "Code of Conduct" then newsagents will close or go out of magazines. Magazines listed above such as Poolside Showcase, Second Hand Boat Secrets and many more niche magazine titles will then disappear as will their publishers because only newsagents sell them being low volume titles. This will be a public detriment.

## Regards

Peter Barrand
newsXpress West Lakes

| Date 28/05/2015 Time 5:57 pm |  |  |  |  |  | Shop Sales |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Description | No. Of <br> Items $\mathbf{Q O H}$ | Total <br> Cost | Date <br> Last Arrived | Total GP \% | Avg. Unit <br> Cost | Avg. \$ <br> Per Day | Avg. Qty. Per Day |

## RETAIL

GORDON AND GOTCH AUST LTD MAGAZINES
Category - ADULT 2

Category - BUYING \& SELLING 5
Category - CHILDREN'S 259
$\begin{array}{lr}\text { Category - COMPUTERS \& GAMING } & 63 \\ \text { Category - CRAFT \& HOBBIES } & 684\end{array}$
Category - CROSSWORDS \& PUZZLES $\quad \mathbf{1 , 0 1 6}$
Category - CURRENT AFFAIRS / BUSINESS 80
Category - FOOD \& WINE
Category - HOME \& LIFESTYLE 517
Category - MEN'S LIFESTYLE
Category - MOTORING
Category - MUSIC \& ENTERTAINMENT

## NETWORK SERVICES

MAGAZINES

Category - ADULT

| \$16.30 | $24.99 \%$ | $\$ 8.15$ | $\$ 0.15$ | 0.01 |
| ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| $\$ 13.47$ | $24.96 \%$ | $\$ 2.69$ | $\$ 0.12$ | 0.03 |
| $\$ 1,047.50$ | $25.00 \%$ | $\$ 4.04$ | $\$ 9.50$ | 1.76 |
| $\$ 765.71$ | $24.99 \%$ | $\$ 12.15$ | $\$ 6.94$ | 0.43 |
| $\$ 6,438.85$ | $25.00 \%$ | $\$ 9.41$ | $\$ 58.40$ | 4.65 |
| $\$ 4,183.69$ | $25.00 \%$ | $\$ 4.12$ | $\$ 37.95$ | 6.91 |
| $\$ 619.38$ | $25.00 \%$ | $\$ 7.74$ | $\$ 5.62$ | 0.54 |
| $\$ 736.48$ | $25.00 \%$ | $\$ 5.75$ | $\$ 6.68$ | 0.87 |
| $\$ 2,980.93$ | $25.00 \%$ | $\$ 5.77$ | $\$ 27.04$ | 3.52 |
| $\$ 403.40$ | $25.00 \%$ | $\$ 6.84$ | $\$ 3.66$ | 0.40 |
| $\$ 2,595.66$ | $25.00 \%$ | $\$ 6.33$ | $\$ 23.54$ | 2.79 |
| $\$ 3,059.87$ | $25.00 \%$ | $\$ 9.47$ | $\$ 27.75$ | 2.20 |
| $\$ 101.05$ | $25.01 \%$ | $\$ 7.22$ | $\$ 0.92$ | 0.10 |
| $\$ 4,235.15$ | $25.00 \%$ | $\$ 9.56$ | $\$ 38.41$ | 3.01 |
| $\$ 13,116.42$ | $25.04 \%$ | $\$ 3.49$ | $\$ 119.03$ | 25.60 |
| $\$ 4,084.66$ | $25.84 \%$ | $\$ 7.49$ | $\$ 37.47$ | 3.71 |
| $\$ 203.55$ | $25.00 \%$ | $\$ 5.50$ | $\$ 1.85$ | 0.25 |
| $\$ 9,309.31$ | $25.00 \%$ | $\$ 3.40$ | $\$ 84.44$ | 18.63 |
| $\$ 53,911.38$ | $25.07 \%$ | $\$ 4.86$ | $\$ 489.47$ | 75.42 |
| $\$ 53,911.38$ | $25.07 \%$ | $\$ 4.86$ | $\$ 489.47$ | 75.42 |
| $\$ 433.59$ |  |  |  |  |
| $\$ 512.41$ |  |  | $\$ 5.29$ | $\$ 3.93$ |

$\square$
25.00\%
$\$ 5.89$
$\$ 4.65$

| Date 28/05/2015 Time 5:57 pm |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | Shop Sales |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Description | No. Of Items | QOH | Total <br> Cost |  | Date <br> Last Arrived | Total GP \% | Avg. Unit <br> Cost | Avg. \$ <br> Per Day | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Avg. Qty. } \\ & \text { Per Day } \end{aligned}$ |
| RETAIL |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Category - CHILDREN'S | 94 |  | \$593.94 |  |  | 25.01\% | \$6.32 | \$5.39 | 0.64 |
| Category - COMPUTERS \& GAMING | 187 |  | \$1,470.42 |  |  | 25.00\% | \$7.86 | \$13.34 | 1.27 |
| Category - CRAFT \& HOBBIES | 938 |  | \$4,074.99 |  |  | 25.00\% | \$4.34 | \$36.96 | 6.38 |
| Category - CROSSWORDS \& PUZZLES | 633 |  | \$2,654.09 |  |  | 25.00\% | \$4.19 | \$24.07 | 4.31 |
| Category - CURRENT AFFAIRS / BUSINESS | 123 |  | \$828.69 |  |  | 25.25\% | \$6.74 | \$7.54 | 0.84 |
| Category - FOOD \& WINE | 150 |  | \$1,319.99 |  |  | 25.23\% | \$8.80 | \$12.01 | 1.02 |
| Category - HOME \& LIFESTYLE | 303 |  | \$1,947.80 |  |  | 25.01\% | \$6.43 | \$17.67 | 2.06 |
| Category - MEN'S LIFESTYLE | 40 |  | \$234.01 |  |  | 25.66\% | \$5.85 | \$2.14 | 0.27 |
| Category - MOTORING | 818 |  | \$5,195.48 |  |  | 25.01\% | \$6.35 | \$47.13 | 5.56 |
| Category - MUSIC \& ENTERTAINMENT | 910 |  | \$3,282.32 |  |  | 25.00\% | \$3.61 | \$29.77 | 6.19 |
| Category - NO MPA CATEGORY | 3 |  | \$11.25 |  |  | 25.00\% | \$3.75 | \$0.10 | 0.02 |
| Category - PARTWORKS | 465 |  | \$2,871.40 |  |  | 25.01\% | \$6.18 | \$26.05 | 3.16 |
| Category - SPECIAL INTEREST | 1,238 |  | \$4,881.09 |  |  | 25.05\% | \$3.94 | \$44.31 | 8.42 |
| Category - SPORT \& LEISURE | 238 |  | \$1,491.29 |  |  | 24.92\% | \$6.27 | \$13.51 | 1.62 |
| Category - TEENAGER | 37 |  | \$201.02 |  |  | 25.00\% | \$5.43 | \$1.82 | 0.25 |
| Category - WOMEN'S INTERESTS | 2,068 |  | \$7,179.33 |  |  | 25.00\% | \$3.47 | \$65.12 | 14.07 |
| Department Total | 8,414 |  | \$39,183.11 |  |  | 25.02\% | \$4.66 | \$355.52 | 57.24 |
| Supplier Total | 8,414 |  | \$39,183.11 | \$52,261.01 | \$13,077.90 | 25.02\% | \$4.66 | \$355.52 | 57.24 |
| Total | 19,501 |  | \$93,094.49 |  |  | 25.05\% | \$11.06 | \$844.98 | 57.24 |
| GST |  |  | \$9,312.17 |  |  | 25.02\% | \$1.11 | \$84.49 |  |
| Total Including GST |  |  | \$102,406.66 |  |  | 25.05\% | \$12.17 | \$929.47 |  |
| Rounding |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Total After Rounding Including GST | 19,501 |  | \$102,406.66 |  |  | 25.15\% | \$12.17 | \$930.68 | 57.24 |

MAGAZINE RETURNS

| NETWORK | From returns form |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| date | supplementary returns qty. mags | supplementary <br> returns \$ exGST | ontime returns qty. mags | ontime returns \$ exGST | Total returns qty. mags | Total returns \$ exGST |
| 8/01/2015 | 116 | 778.17 | 188 | 534.27 | 304 | 1312.44 |
| 15/01/2015 | 101 | 717.53 | 169 | 708.08 | 270 | 1425.61 |
| 22/01/2015 | 120 | 919.62 | 130 | 632.21 | 250 | 1551.83 |
| 29/01/2015 | 129 | 630.47 | 194 | 867.73 | 323 | 1498.2 |
| 5/02/2015 | 125 | 927.92 | 62 | 326.17 | 187 | 1254.09 |
| 12/02/2015 | 111 | 633.51 | 185 | 893.46 | 296 | 1526.97 |
| 19/02/2015 | 197 | 1437.29 | 138 | 657.44 | 335 | 2094.73 |
| 26/02/2015 | 176 | 1104.94 | 178 | 875.68 | 354 | 1980.62 |
| 6/03/2015 | 207 | 979.19 | 147 | 685.75 | 354 | 1664.94 |
| 12/03/2015 | 149 | 1017.11 | 201 | 932.08 | 350 | 1949.19 |
| 19/03/2015 | 391 | 1366.21 | 238 | 1139.65 | 629 | 2505.86 |
| 26/03/2015 | 270 | 1652.86 | 168 | 780.83 | 438 | 2433.69 |
| 2/04/2015 | 130 | 851.02 | 97 | 467.92 | 227 | 1318.94 |
| 9/04/2015 | 104 | 667.19 | 149 | 698.10 | 253 | 1365.29 |
| 16/04/2015 | 239 | 1667.44 | 200 | 789.30 | 439 | 2456.74 |
| 23/04/2015 | 144 | 811.71 | 193 | 923.4 | 337 | 1735.11 |
| 30/04/2015 | 180 | 1060.96 | 124 | 662.84 | 304 | 1723.8 |
| 7/05/2015 | 96 | 644.02 | 87 | 442.87 | 183 | 1086.89 |
| 14/05/2015 | 315 | 2143.33 | 192 | 962.89 | 507 | 3106.22 |
| 21/05/2015 | 91 | 490.19 | 193 | 940.72 | 284 | 1430.91 |
| 28/05/2015 | 178 | 1059.99 | 162 | 805.22 | 340 | 1865.21 |
|  |  |  |  |  | 0 | 0 |
| Total for period (21 weeks) | 3,569 | \$ 21,560.67 | 3,395 | \$ 15,726.61 | 6,964 | \$ 37,287.28 |

MAGAZINE RETURNS

GOTCH From EDI Returns Claim Acknowledgement

|  | supplementary | supplementary | ontime return ontime returns | Total returns | Total returns |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| date | return qty. mags | returns $\$$ exGST | qty. mags | \$ exGST | qty. mags | \$ exGST |



MAGAZINE RETURNS

NETWORK + GOTCH

| date | supplementary return qty. mags | supplementary returns \$ exGST | ontime returns qty. mags | ontime returns \$ exGST | Total returns qty. mags | Total returns \$ exGST |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 8/01/2015 | 373 | 2617.55 | 493 | 2362.64 | 866 | 4980.19 |
| 15/01/2015 | 177 | 1293.41 | 290 | 1461.84 | 467 | 2755.25 |
| 22/01/2015 | 187 | 1473.67 | 311 | 1932.06 | 498 | 3405.73 |
| 29/01/2015 | 285 | 1591.76 | 312 | 1491.78 | 597 | 3083.54 |
| 5/02/2015 | 271 | 1867.25 | 239 | 1409.91 | 510 | 3277.16 |
| 12/02/2015 | 201 | 1251.11 | 389 | 2058.1 | 590 | 3309.21 |
| 19/02/2012 | 300 | 2231.63 | 325 | 1853.51 | 625 | 4085.14 |
| 26/02/2012 | 355 | 2450.29 | 373 | 2133.33 | 728 | 4583.62 |
| 6/03/2015 | 375 | 2033.64 | 327 | 1777.39 | 702 | 3811.03 |
| 12/03/2015 | 237 | 1624.4 | 415 | 2228.52 | 652 | 3852.92 |
| 19/03/2015 | 574 | 2514.16 | 446 | 2486.54 | 1020 | 5000.7 |
| 26/03/2015 | 470 | 2910.8 | 360 | 2008.21 | 830 | 4919.01 |
| 2/04/2015 | 264 | 1784.1 | 257 | 1508.3 | 521 | 3292.4 |
| 9/04/2015 | 211 | 1359.59 | 334 | 1862.57 | 545 | 3222.16 |
| 16/04/2015 | 387 | 2809.95 | 397 | 2268.98 | 784 | 5078.93 |
| 23/04/2015 | 292 | 1695.61 | 346 | 1810.24 | 638 | 3505.85 |
| 30/04/2015 | 314 | 1951.44 | 327 | 1856.06 | 641 | 3807.5 |
| 7/05/2015 | 239 | 1601.91 | 272 | 1589.79 | 511 | 3191.7 |
| 14/05/2015 | 490 | 3408.95 | 364 | 2058.31 | 854 | 5467.26 |
| 21/05/2015 | 179 | 1046.09 | 448 | 2540.98 | 627 | 3587.07 |
| 28/05/2015 | 267 | 1692.84 | 378 | 2083.48 | 645 | 3776.32 |
|  | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| TOTAL for period | 6,448 | \$ 41,210.15 | 7,403 | \$ 40,782.54 | 13,851 | \$ 81,992.69 |
| (21 weeks) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| \% supplementary retur | urns qty. Network(Bauer) |  | 55.40\% |  |  |  |
| \% supplementary retur | urns qty. Gotch |  | 44.60\% |  |  |  |
| \% ontime returns qty | . Network(Bauer) |  | 45.86\% |  |  |  |
| \% ontime returns qty | . Gotch |  | 54.14\% |  |  |  |
| \% of total returns qty | . Network(Bauer) |  | 50.28\% |  |  |  |
| \% of total returns qty | . Gotch |  | 49.72\% |  |  |  |
| \% of total sales Network(Bauer), from supplier sales analysis \% of total sales Gotch, from supplier sales analysis |  |  | 42\% |  |  |  |
|  |  |  | 58\% |  |  |  |




## $\mathrm{W} 40^{15} 2 / 4 \$ 9.95$ POOLSIDE SHOWCASE \#2 West Lakes NDC 4T DB 20/08 0602  977144888500922



The



